

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

CRIM. NO. 11-cr-20468

HON. ARTHUR TARNOW

D-28 PRADEEP PANDYA, R.Ph.  
D-29 VIKAS SHARMA, R.Ph.  
D-30 MUKESH KHUNT, R.Ph.  
D-31 RICHARD UTARNACHITT, M.D.  
D-32 RUBEN BENITO, M.D.  
D-33 CARL FOWLER, M.D.  
D-34 JAVAID BASHIR, M.D.  
D-35 RAJAT DANIEL, M.D.  
D-37 ATUL PATEL  
D-38 ANTNOY MACKLIN, a.k.a. "Jimbo"  
D-39 MICHAEL THORAN, a.k.a. "Ace,"

Defendants.

---

**STIPULATION FOR FINDING OF EXCLUDABLE DELAY**

The parties above, by and through their counsel, hereby stipulate and agree that this Court should enter a finding of excludable delay under the Speedy Trial Act as to the above-captioned defendants from April 10, 2013 through January 6, 2014, which is the date the Court has set for the trial of Trial Group 3 in this matter. In support of the stipulation, the parties submit as follows:

This case is exceptionally complex. The volume of discovery in this matter, especially with respect to the six-plus months of wiretap material obtained in the course of the government's investigation, is substantial. A superseding indictment was unsealed on March 19, 2013, and defense counsel for the above-named defendants are just beginning to receive and analyze the voluminous discovery in this case. Defendants need a substantial block of time to

review and assess the discovery in this case, file any appropriate motions, and discuss the prospect of plea agreements in this case. Defendants also need time to prepare for trial if that is how they ultimately decide to resolve the case.

Given the volume of discovery, the scope of the allegations, the need to conduct meaningful plea discussions, and file appropriate motions, it is necessary to continue this trial and to exclude time to enable defense counsel to adequately review all relevant material and to prepare for trial. The parties therefore submit that the ends of justice served by excluding the time between April 10, 2013 and January 6, 2014, outweigh the best interest of the public and the defendants to a speedy trial.

Therefore, the parties above stipulate and agree that the period from April 10, 2013 through January 6, 2014 shall constitute excludable delay under the provisions of 18 U.S.C. § 3161(h)(7)(A), and that the ends of justice served by this delay outweigh the best interests of the defendant and the public in a speedy trial.

IT IS SO STIPULATED.

BARBARA L. MCQUADE.  
United States Attorney

s/John K. Neal  
Assistant U.S. Attorney  
211 W. Fort Street, Suite 2001  
Detroit, MI 48226  
John.Neal@usdoj.gov  
(313) 226-9644  
Attorney for the United States

s/Sanford Plotkin  
Sandord Plotkin, PC  
615 Griswold Street, Suite 1116  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: 313-963-9310  
[Sanfordplotkin1@comcast.net](mailto:Sanfordplotkin1@comcast.net)  
Attorney for defendant Pradeep Pandya

s/Mark J. Kriger

Allison L. Kriger  
LaRene & Kriger  
645 Griswold Street, Suite 1717  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: 313-967-0100  
Email: [mkriger@sbcglobal.net](mailto:mkriger@sbcglobal.net)  
Attorney for defendant Vikas Sharma

s/Henry M. Scharg

302 W. Main Street  
Northville, MI 48267  
Phone: 248-596-1111  
[hmsattyatlaw@aol.com](mailto:hmsattyatlaw@aol.com)  
Attorney for defendant Mukesh Khunt

s/Ronnie E. Cromer

65 Cadillac Tower, Suite 2605  
Detroit, MI 48226  
(313) 965-6633  
Attorney for defendant Richard Utarnachitt

s/Barry A. Resnick

30300 Northwestern Hwy., Suite 303  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334  
Phone: 248-851-3887  
Fax: 248-932-4009  
[barcorvette@hotmail.com](mailto:barcorvette@hotmail.com)  
Attorney for defendant Ruben Benito

s/Steven F. Fishman

615 Griswold Street, Suite 1125  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: 313-962-4090  
[sfish66@yahoo.com](mailto:sfish66@yahoo.com)  
Attorney for defendant Carl Fowler

s/Thomas M. Loeb

32000 Northwestern Hwy., Ste. 170  
Farmington Hills, MI 48334  
Phone: 248-851-2020  
Fax: 248-851-2525 [tmloeb@mich.com](mailto:tmloeb@mich.com)  
P25913  
Attorney for defendant Javaid Bashir

s/David F. DuMouchel  
Butzel Long  
150 W. Jefferson Avenue, Suite 100  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: 313-225-7000  
[dumouchd@butzel.com](mailto:dumouchd@butzel.com)  
Attorney for defendant Rajat Daniel

s/John Freeman  
Law Office of John Freeman PLLC  
3150 Livernois Road, Ste. 270  
Troy, MI 48083  
Phone: 248-250-9950  
Fax: 248-250-5857  
Attorney for defendant Atul Patel

s/Sidney Kraizman  
1616 Ford Building  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Phone: 313-961-7078  
Attorney for defendant Anthony Macklin

s/William J. Winters, III  
32401 Eight Mile  
Livonia, MI 48152-3104  
Phone: 313-510-3316  
[freezewinters@aol.com](mailto:freezewinters@aol.com)  
Attorney for defendant Michael Thoran

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

CRIM. NO. 11-cr-20468

HON. ARTHUR TARNOW

v.

D-28 PRADEEP PANDYA, R.Ph.  
D-29 VIKAS SHARMA, R.Ph.  
D-30 MUKESH KHUNT, R.Ph.  
D-31 RICHARD UTARNACHITT, M.D.  
D-32 RUBEN BENITO, M.D.  
D-33 CARL FOWLER, M.D.  
D-34 JAVAID BASHIR, M.D.  
D-35 RAJAT DANIEL, M.D.  
D-37 ATUL PATEL  
D-38 ANTHONY MACKLIN, a.k.a. "Jimbo"  
D-39 MICHAEL THORAN, a.k.a. "Ace,"

Defendants.

---

**ORDER FOR CONTINUANCE OF TRIAL DATE  
AND FINDING OF EXCLUDABLE DELAY**

Upon this Court's consideration of the stipulation of the parties for a finding of excludable delay, the Court being apprised of the circumstances, **IT IS HEREBY ORDERED** that the time period between April 10, 2013, and January 6, 2014, shall be deemed excludable delay as to the above-captioned defendants under the provisions of the Speedy Trial Act, 18 U.S.C. § 3161. Considering the factors listed in section 3161(h)(7)(A), specifically the complexity of the case, especially with respect to the thousands of pages of wiretap material obtained in the course of the government's investigation, the volume of discovery, the large number of defendants, and the need to conduct plea negotiations, the Court concludes that a

delay in the trial date as to these defendants is necessary to enable defense counsel to adequately review the discovery, conduct plea negotiations, and/or to prepare for trial. The Court adopts the reasons set forth in the stipulation of the parties, and finds that this delay is the minimum necessary to afford this set of defendants their right to effective assistance of counsel. This Court finds that the ends of justice served by this delay outweigh the best interests of the defendants and the public in a speedy trial. The Court also notes that the defendant Anthony Macklin has now stipulated to excluding this time, rendering the Government's motion seeking such an exclusion (Docket Entry 863) moot.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

s/Arthur J. Tarnow  
ARTHUR J. TARNOW  
United States District Judge

Entered: April 17, 2013